



## 4FRI Stakeholder Group (SHG) Meeting

Wednesday, August 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2023 9 am – Noon

Coconino National Forest Supervisor's Office

1824 South Thompson Street, Flagstaff, AZ 86001

### RECORDING

<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1jfyNAlcSp4giZD-f64TgKlfzxEXiwqg7/view?usp=sharing>

### Participants:

John Richardson, Pascal Berlioux, Alison Gitlyn, Cerissa Hoglander, Amanda Webb, Neil Chapman, Tracy Bazelman, Elizabeth Johnston, Todd Schulke, Thomas Holl, Jason Van Der Toorn, Shaula Hedwall, Paul Chapman, Brett Crary, Melanie Colavito, Amy Waltz, James Perkins, Tom Mackin, Mike Hannemann, Aaron Mayville, Greg Smith, Brad Worsley, Joel Jurgens, Travis Woolley, Tabi Bolton, Lisa Bolton, Elvy Barton, Dick Fleishman, Devon Suarez, Jay Smith, Nicole Branton

**Facilitation Team:** Carrie Eberly, Andi Rogers (Southwest Decision Resources)

### 9:20 Approve June 28th Stakeholder Group Meeting minutes and Review Action Items (SDR)

- Spelling error on Devon's names
- Approved

Action Item	Lead	Status
1. Follow up with RMRS fire modeling groups for presentations	Amy, Maggie	REMOVE
2. See if reporting tons removed as a progress update metric to see what is happening on the landscape before units are done cutting	Brett C.	DONE
3. Follow up about the Comprehensive Implementation Working Group letter to the Forest Service	Rob W.	DONE
4. Pri-opt team will present to 4FRI exec board about workshop idea and continue to flesh out workshop plan	Amy, Chris, Scot, Aaron	ONGOING
5. Share Coconino Fuels contact with Amy W.	Chris J.	DONE
6. Post presentations to Basecamp, add Dick F. to Basecamp	Melanie C., Jay S.	DONE

- RMRS Modeling: Maggie has left for a year, remove this item. Working with R3 fire analyst now
- Reporting tons removed (Brett C.):
  - Looked at volume for reporting each month, Forest Products Financial system creates report. Each contract is broken up by forest product and unit of measure.
  - Many ways to report. Can report CCF and tonnage. Tons gives you a better feel over what happened in the last month. Crosses biomass, small wood, etc. Not all sales report tons. If tons are the most important there would need to be a conversion.
  - Another table would be helpful. Weekly status check FS are happening, are they reporting tons? Agreement that tons are more accurate.
  - What is the most valuable table? Summary data is useful. Keep table but add tons.
  - Seeing it spatially would be helpful as well, in the long term. The issue is only FS acres being reported, there are other areas, this is problematic. There is a national effort to combine all data into one area.
- Prioritization-optimization met with 4FRI team. There is support for this, no date yet. More to come

#### 9:45 Call to the Public

- None

#### 9:45 USFS updates – Aaron Mayville

- Across the country, pressure on Regions/Forests that hold priority landscapes. Appreciates the SHG, need to show monthly accomplishments. “Doing ok” but question around targets about what we are setting out for ourselves. Burned more acres this year than ever, recognition that we are getting after it.
- Still fine-tuning reporting, how we tell the story, more work here to be done. Call to the SHG group to help report.
  - Tons/month is a start.
  - Chief is having meetings monthly where there is an opportunity to report. 4FRI not the only game in town, 20 other landscapes are vying for funding.
- There is a lack of GIS capacity and overall many positions that need to be filled in 4FRI. FS is struggling to fill seats/needs especially as it relates to data.
- Nicole B: Agency is trying to figure out the “right way”. Need to tier to how things are reported in DC (e.g., common reporting with DOI/FS). Good to do more thinking on metrics and reporting accomplishments.
- John Souther and Mark N. positions yet to be filled. Agency started national hiring in March, just seeing the 1<sup>st</sup> pulse. Multiple phases, there is a hope here.
- Needs to be the “right acres, it isn’t just about the total number of acres. Prioritization-optimization will help with this.
- Still figuring out how to tell the story, Need to develop a FS narrative. How many starts? Tonnage? Need to decide collectively what is important, then report.
- What’s the updates on “acres released”? Are the acres not “coming down”?

- Hiring plays into this, no TMA's on districts, contract prep is limited, enterprise has helped in the past but also failed to fill these lately, primarily capacity related. Need to look at other processes.
- What does the future of 4FRI project look like, large or small scale, who will help inform this?
  - FS hasn't made that decision and is trying to figure that out. Struggling to figure out what implementation looks like.
- Industry asks to have that conversation WITH them. How to frame this?
- Time to reconvene another Industry meeting? County, TNC, and others will discuss.
- Bill Williams: It's clear the way it was packaged wasn't going to work. Have taken a step back. Helpful to have some conversation about this, and how to make industry interested in this. Re-packaging.
- Elephant in the room: If we put hard acres aside, when do we address the acres that aren't being done by them. Consider additional external capacity to reach implementation if there is a need.
- Discussion of equipment needed as well.
- Scot Rogers, offered the permanent 4FRI lead, released Monday.
- No specifics on monitoring hiring, but this is in the queue. Hopefully very soon.
- Wildfire Commission report will be out next month. Lots of recommendations & details in there about how we could measure progress vs traditional federal "targets".

### 10:00 Industry Updates

- Perkins Natural Resources:
  - 8 acres near Garland acquired lease, purchased another sawmill. Putting 2 larger sawmills here, can double production/loads/day.
  - Company is growing- 30 employees and still hiring.
  - New processor 953H John Deer processor.
  - About 2/3 thirds done with a Williams project, finishing Munds – should be done by Nov 15<sup>th</sup>.
  - 49R next, 600 loads of logs before winter.
- Novo Power:
  - Up time is excellent at Novo
  - 3 days of usable inventory, right on the edge
  - Request is Sawmill Springs, Bill Williams impacted them. If Sawmill Springs doesn't happen, winter will be really challenging.
  - Tom H. and Brad W. did a big tour, saw Devon's sites.
    - Tom is frustrated, not managing contractors the same, massive differential on what can be left, compliance, etc.
    - Change in roads from A-S to Coconino. A-S better. If we want to move material better, 300 road must be improved. Industry screaming for wood, but it's hard to get to.
  - Trucking capacity is limited for some companies. Number 1 and 2 cost is power purchased to run facility, continues going up. January-June they lost money, not

sustainable, couldn't run production. Stewardship contract with FS needs resolution. Every 7/8 months they close to improve; they can't do it this year. Hoping to defer only 6 months. They need Sawmill Springs.

- Joel:
  - Parks West on the Kaibab, 622 acres combined TSI and timber harvest, best month ever.
  - Sawmill Springs is next, east side of Parks West. Near Moonset on the Kaibab. 690 acres in Sawmill.
- Tabi B.:
  - Innovative things happening, can be burned more rapidly.
  - Roads are an issue, would be good to get roads reports.
  - FS, SRP, and others working on 300 road from 95 r-87 work will be done. Making wider, turnouts every ½ mile. Slow moving, but happening.
- Devon S.:
  - Almost finished Baker, hopefully, this winter, move to Roosevelt.
  - Picked up the pace. 17-20 loads/day. 400 cut and skid in Roosevelt (100 acres per week).
  - New feller buncher tomorrow. Looking to get another processor asap. Need to be at 35-40 logs/day to meet customers.
  - MSO- is not a "waiver" for the owl. Based on survey work by the FWS and FS were able to lift breeding restrictions because of where owls were and nesting status, per the consultation with USFWS.
- Coconino County: going to do least a mile of work for carbon crusher. Adding tree lignin in to mix for roads (done in Norway, and it's working well), so County will try this.
- Jason V.:
  - Roads are a big challenge.
  - Not having wood in front of us for up to 2 years, makes customers think about investment. Timber fiber getting to Phoenix is key to making this work.
  - Want to create enough forward wood for contractors.
  - Importing into phoenix train cars of lumber, prefer this to come from local sources
  - Imploring folks to help move product from forest to finished products (e.g., pallets)
  - Open order for 5000 tons – need many acres to fill this, would love to have 4000 or 5000 acres in front of them.
  - Need more acres to ensure customer that supply chain is secure. This is a major talking point for every sales calls. Customers want certainty of supply.
- Dick F.: How do we increase the logger capacity for a winter deck. Doubling acres/year in some cases.
  - Nobody has a winter deck this year and that's stressful – industry wide. Everyone wants more.
- There is a need for industry-specific conversations, potentially at another time. Lots to cover.

### **10:30 Working Group Updates – All**

- Prioritization-Optimization – Amy Waltz

- Hampered by capacity issues, met with FS for a brainstorming session. Sounds like more people are being added to the team.
- Treatment prioritization-optimization. Constant need for reeducating. Letter of commitment. WCS emphasis out of Washington Office also wants to do good work on prioritization and optimization so we are leveraging. In addition, performance metrics. No dates coming up due to capacity.
- More clarity from FS internally, some landscapes have started, how it relates to Wildfire Crisis Strategy. Workshop and post-workshop priority reporting is key.
- Industry discussion feeds into prioritization-optimization critically.
- WCS – identified keystone partners – only TNC and a few others are signed charter members. Need to invite NFF and Wild Turkey as signatories due to their roles. Missing voice.
- 50 of the right acres, vs 1000 of the wrong acres, prioritization-optimization can help. Comment on this process.
- “Gold standard” vs “green standard”. FS example, Newman Park coming up, wing east, both important near communities, but the question is, which one is more important? Criteria makes it harder/better. FS needs support here.
- Next steps needed:
  - Another person to lead the effort needed: FS person ideally.
  - Bring steering group back together and get back on 4FRI executive team agenda.
- Comprehensive Implementation Working Group – Cerissa Hoglander
  - Field visit in July to Buck Spring and Houston Draw (Mogollon Rim)
    - Multiyear wet meadow restoration project
    - More work to be done on erosion control.
    - Buck Spring exclosures to be updated.
    - Work being done with Elks Society, FONAF, Grand Canyon Trust
  - Merit Draw work was done too. Wet meadow work, pressure from overgrazing.
- Multi-party Monitoring Board – Cerissa Hoglander
  - Thanks to Brett for meeting with Travis/Cerissa about budget challenges. FY 23 got reallocated due to lack of FS coordinator, impacted FY 24 budget request which was stakeholder developed – this had to be updated.
  - Subgroups
    - Snowtography – likely to establish. A new site on the Coconino coming.
    - Ground plot group, taking on more plots and new ones in Rim Country.
    - Songbird data is wrapped up.
  - Been a year without a monitoring coordinator.

### **11:00 “Redefining” the role of the SHG**

Review of survey data and previous discussions

- Steering Committee is already reviewing the charter.

- Is there permission from the group to refine the roles and details of the SHG group, based on conversations today?
  - Changes range from meeting schedules to the role of the SHG.
  - The stakeholder group will be able to approve the changes.
  - Group agrees to this proposal.

### Course for the future

- Working sessions are key. Updates may not be necessary in the way we share them. Newsletters as a product of a working session could be valuable to get work done.
- Two huge things came up as priority in the survey: prioritization, implementation, monitoring.
- Work through the issues, instead of just talking about them during updates. Do this through a work session.
  - Need to take frustrations and do something about that. Need to move the needle for industry.
  - The whole role of the meeting could be prioritization and optimization.
  - Industry workgroup doesn't persist:
    - Isn't heard, nothing happens. Worried about winter decks today.
    - All competing – but there are potential commonalities to collaborate on (e.g., roads, etc.).
    - Recommendations not being followed.
    - Just keep coming to take precedence over fire.
- SHG meetings may not be the place to hammer out issues.
  - May need smaller groups, not relevant to everyone.
  - Need to craft agendas to make sure the right people are in the room with the resources to resolve issues. Move the actions item up and that's the next meeting.
  - We are meeting bi-monthly, maybe the in-between time could be work sessions.
    - Field trips can also happen during this time when appropriate.
  - Set a special industry session: September. Shouldn't be competing with each other.
  - Work does not happen at the pace and scale it needs to. Need to tackle specific issues, roads, industry, etc.
- Recommended agenda change: Consider gaps in between meetings and do a special session on those topics. But the SHG meetings are also important to get an overview of what is going on.
- General industry questions need discussion for all, not just industry. Need open workshop format. Others have interest in these topics.
- SHG has been clear cut for planning, not much precedent for collaboration with implementation, because: competition with industry. Collaboration looks different.
- Curious to understand in the context of the WCS what the FS perspective is. What does the SHG bring to the table? This is important to inform the role of the group and high-capacity partners. What does it look like?
  - Nicole B.:

- Prioritization-optimization, ecosystem perspective is valuable, to be upsized for WCS. Industry sharing, how do we package, thinking, access, biomass, seasonality, etc. overlay of these things for discussions on priority areas.
  - Telling story – what are the right metrics?
  - Struggle of staffing for industry and FS - how do we solve this, how fill the gaps, how do keystone partners fit in?
- Aaron M.:
  - Implementation and operations.
  - Strategy industry vision and information sharing.
  - Communication and politics and social license.
- We have every other month meetings, updates are important – can help us pinpoint needs, and then there can be follow up meetings to do work. Need to have forest service staff present for these work sessions. Then need follow through to make things happen – need consistent follow up.
- Elvy – we need working group related to the implementers (DFFM, TNC, etc.). We have individual meetings with partners to create coordination plans and be complementary with one another. Need this larger implementer group to come together and meet with the Forest Service. We have limited industry capacity – need to better communicate and coordinate around that. This coordination can happen, but needs to be better. This can help Forest Service.
  - Have annual planning meeting with Tonto, Coconino, and Prescott. Operators not in the room generally.
  - Have talked about lots of road work. Some planning is out four to five years – can plan ahead.
  - Breakdown is generally related to FS capacity and also a lack of feedback loop.
  - This coordination is crucial – how feedback is incorporated and communicated.
- Next steps
  - SRP has individual partner meetings already planned out – but this could be a full-group meeting instead of individually. They can coordinate message about plan for next two years to share with industry so that they can plan better.
  - Industry meetings are separate from implementer meetings. They are operating on different time scales.
- Everyone that comes to this room has an interest in forests generally with sub interests (e.g., wildlife, livelihood). It isn't effective to only bring these interests forward to the 4FRI meeting (e.g., Tom generally goes directly to FS staff instead of 4FRI). FS personnel are crucial to moving things forward.
  - The turnover and change in FS personnel is a huge challenge.
  - The SHG provides a role in providing overall updates about what is happening, and this is valuable.
  - From a FS standpoint, not sure if there is a metric to measure effectiveness of efforts (e.g., road improvements – no metric to address). Lacking metrics for

many interests, these need to be tracked and FS personnel need to be held accountable.

- Continue to face FS budget challenges – need to overcome these.
- There is still value in SHG as is – but there is also value in the in-between months to get work sessions to grind through the issues.
  - Success for collaborative meetings – shared updates, common understanding, real engagement, quarterly, then in between months is effective work.
  - Real engagement is a challenge for such a large group. This SHG could meet quarterly and spend more time in smaller groups to grind through these issues.
- There is a real need to redefine the role of the SHG. This redefinition is common in all groups.

#### **11:40 Charter, Path Forward, MOU Review - SDR and Jay Smith**

- Governance documents do warrant revision – Melanie will lead. Todd, Dick, Lisa B., Scot R. can join.
- Key documents: Charter, MOU, Path Forward, Strategic Plan.
  - Melanie is also writing the last ten-year 4FRI history. This is forthcoming in the course of the next year.
- This group can review key documents and develop proposals for a path forward for the SHG to review.

#### **11:45 Future meetings**

- Meeting schedule moving forward:
  - Bimonthly for the typical SHG format
  - Option for work sessions between these
    - Topic-based
    - Field trip-based
  - Location
    - Next meeting: October 25, East side
    - Could use AGFD location, CSO location
  - Field trip
    - Springs potentially
    - Black River – they have made some headway, but may need more time.
    - Steering Committee can decide on this.
    - Field trips are good opportunity to dig into the issues that we are dealing with.

#### **11:55 Disclosures**

- SRP:
  - Ecohydrology project in Dude Fire area – soil moisture, evaporation, transpiration, water quality, etc. Working with NAU and Rocky Mountain Research Station.
  - Partnership announcement tomorrow.



- TNC:
  - Late July signed a keystone agreement, 50 million, and other for funding.
  - Working to develop capacity to get more land burned and other efforts.
  - TNC Arizona is initiating a local fire learning project.

**11:55 Review Action Items – SDR**

Action Item	Lead	Status
Create/add a tonnage table for contracts (to best show activity activity and inactivity).	Brett - by next month	
Add Amanda Webb and Jason to basecamp	Melanie	
Discuss additional Industry meeting	Jay, Joel, James	
Explore getting roads reports monthly	Aaron, Brett	
Provide clarity on keystone partners and relationship to 4FRI	Nicole	
Identify staff for prioritization-optimization	Nicole	
Follow up on idea about implementers meeting	Elvy, SDR	
Convene charter working group	Melanie, Todd, Dick, Lisa, Scot	
Aquatic/watershed restoration monthly updates	Brett	

**Adjourn –**

**Steering Committee Meetings (second Tuesday of each month)**

- 1/10/2023, 2/14/2023, 3/14/2023, 4/11/2023, 5/9/2023, 6/13/2023, 7/11/2023, 8/8/2023, 9/12/2023, 10/10/2023, 11/14/2023, December no meeting

**Stakeholder Group Meetings (fourth Wednesday of each month, except November)**

- 1/25/2023, 2/22/2023, 3/22/2023, 4/26/2023, 5/24/2023, 6/28/2023, 8/23/2023, 10/25/2023, 11/29/2023, December no meeting

	<b>2023</b>	
	<b>Hot Chair</b>	<b>Cold Chair</b>
January	Melanie Colavito	Neil Chapman

February	Neil Chapman	Jay Smith
March	Neil Chapman	Jay Smith
April	Neil Chapman	Jay Smith
May	Jay Smith	Anne Mottek
June	Jay Smith	Anne Mottek
July	Jay Smith	Anne Mottek
August	Jay Smith	Anne Mottek
September	Jay Smith	Anne Mottek
October	Jay Smith	Anne Mottek
November	Anne Mottek	Pascal Berlioux?
December	NO SHG MTG	NO SHG MTG