



## 4FRI Stakeholder Group Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, July 22, 2015, 9AM – 1PM

Arizona Game and Fish – Region II Office

3500 South Lake Mary Road, Flagstaff, AZ 86005

Teleconference line: (712) 775-7031, code: 439290611#

**Attendance:** Paul Summerfelt, Tiffany Woods, Jay Smith (GEP), Tom Mackin, Karen Durant, Gary Snider, Wally Covington, Scott Harger, Diane Vosick, Anne Mottek, Travis Woolley, David Dorum, Greg Smith, Aaron Green, Billy Masters, Bruce Greco, Joe Miller, Tommie Martin, Ann DeMarco, Sue Sitko, Neil Chapman, Jessica Gist, Patti Turpin, Bryce Esch, Amy Waltz, Rebecca Davidson, Audrey Owens, Kelly Wolf-Krauter, Stephen Flora, Brienne Pettit, John Buehler, Annette Fredette, Dick Fleishman, Buck Swaney, Ethan Aumack

**On the Phone:** Sid Morgan, Todd Schulke, Lori Martinek

Note: Co-Chair Steve Gatewood was unable to attend today's meeting. Paul Summerfelt will be acting co-chair in today's meeting.

### 9:05 Approve minutes from June 24<sup>nd</sup> SHG meeting — Berlioux

Minutes Approved

### 9:10 Review action items from June 24<sup>nd</sup> SHG meeting — Berlioux

Action Item	Lead	Status	Note
1. Develop a working group tasked with reviewing the Charter	Unknown	Postponed	This will be completed by the Steering Committee
2. Summarize NRWG discussion (Integration Interests) and present to Supervisor Whiting	Sitko/Berlioux	Complete	Will discuss new "Joint Feedback" document later in today's meeting
3. Contact Patrick Rappold to have him initiate the Industry and Utilization Group: membership, charter, etc.	Sitko	Complete	Patrick will not lead a 4FRI Industry Work Group. Arizona State Forest (AZSF) is developing an Industry Panel. Will be discussed in today's meeting
4. Post the MPMB request for clarification on the resolution letter on BASECAMP	Esch	In Progress	Will be discussed under Working Group Updates
5. Contact Dr. Jack Williams for a presentation on T&E fish in the Southwest	Miller	In Progress	Date of presentation needs to be determined. Preferably October or November timeframe
6. Contact Steve Gatewood to confirm that he will be able to be one of the upcoming co-chairs	Berlioux	Complete	
7. July SHG agenda item: Working group charter presentations.	Berlioux/Summerfelt	In Progress	
8. Post anticipated dates and FS notes to BASECAMP	Fredette	Complete	Attached to 06/22/15 SHG Minutes

**Action Item:** Determine date for Dr. Jack Williams's presentation on T&E fish in the Southwest.

## 9:20 Call to the Public

No request from public to speak

## 9:25 Stakeholder Disclosures and Announcements – All

- **Swaney Status Update** – Buck will continue working on the facilitation contract through its conclusion in September.
- **BASECAMP Opt-in Deadline** – Send email to [Tiffany.Woods@nau.edu](mailto:Tiffany.Woods@nau.edu) to remain on the BASECAMP distribution list. The deadline is July 31<sup>st</sup>, 2015.
- **Steering Committee Update** – Bryce Esch, from ERI, will now be recording SC Calls.
- **Salt River Project (SRP) Announcement** – The Forest Health, Vibrant Economy Conference will occur on October 7-8. Please contact Rebecca Davidson for further information.
- **Arizona Wildlife Federation (AWF)** – Tom Mackin is no longer President of the AWF, he will continue to represent the AWF at 4FRI meetings and remain the Region II Director. Brad Powell is now the AWF President.
- **The Nature Conservancy (TNC)** – The TNC has completed a few agreements with the FS, one is a master agreement with the Kaibab and Coconino National Forests. It is an overarching agreement that allows them to continue to do supplemental agreements. TNC also setup a case study on the Clark task order (TO) to assess their tablet technology. With the tablet technology they are able to create digital markers which is nearly 5 times faster than physically marking the areas with paint; 40 acres/day vs. 8 acres/day. They will have a better production and economic analysis in 6 months.
- **Trout Unlimited** – Joe Miller is now a member of the technical working group component of the Adaptive Management Work Group for the Glen Canyon Dam.

**Action Item:** Establish a TNC Tablet Technology Presentation and field trip to the Clark TO for an upcoming SHG Meeting. Potentially the September meeting.

## 9:35 USFS [Monthly] Update – Fleishman

- Tom Tidwell Visit

Coconino National Forest was able to host Chief Tidwell during his Arizona visit to view copper mines. During his stay, he was able to view some 4FRI related sites. One of these sites was the Camilla managed fire where the FS was able to highlight their collaboration with the Fish and Wildlife Service (FWS) because of the treatments that had taken place in June within Mexican spotted owl (MSO) protected activity centers (PAC). Concerning the collaborative, Chief Tidwell was able to meet many 4FRI representatives and mentioned that he was impressed with the prescriptions that were being done and appreciates the work of the stakeholder group.

- Task Order Update

The monthly update is available on BASECAMP. Dick Fleishman is working on revising the first page of the update to make it easier to interpret by removing the activities because the other pages of the update include all added activities. There has been an increase in acres by Good Earth Power (GEPAZ). The FS did repurpose some FY15 task orders into timber sale offerings outside of the 4FRI contract, please view tables 8 and 9 on the update for more information. This year has had favorable conditions for prescribed and managed fires, since October first they have been able to report more than 70,000 acres.

*The FS June update is available on BASECAMP*

## 9:45 Discussion with Forest Service – Fredette

The FS expects to present on the NEPA planning process for the second EIS at the August SHG meeting. This includes a review of the second EIS project area and a summary of the similarities and differences between the first and second EIS as well as a review of the basic steps of the NEPA process. There will be a discussion on the desired conditions that have already been established in the current FS forest plans and how they will determine the proposed action. There are currently two forest plans that are in different stages of revisions and the FS wants to be prepared for amendments that will be needed. They would like SHG feedback on what other items should be amended. Finally, USFS will request input on the landscape strategy (LS), they want to know if the existing LS incorporates the needed vegetation types.

The anticipated timeline is as follows:

August 2015: Forest plan desired conditions

September 2015: Deadline for SHG feedback on desired conditions

November 2015: Revisit preponderance of young large trees

March 2016: Existing conditions and draft Proposed Action

April 2016: Deadline for SHG feedback on existing conditions and draft Proposed Action

2017: Draft EIS

The primary desired conditions that have been determined by the FS include: dry-mixed conifer, aspen, grasslands, pine-chaparral types, and perennial stream.

Paul Summerfelt would like the following questions addressed during the August presentation: While it is known that there are many items that would need to be added to the first EIS for the second EIS, are there things in the first EIS that will be excluded? What are things the FS could see as potential pinch-points that could delay the process?

The FS will present to either a working group or the SHG, however, they must receive a formal request from the group.

**Action Item:** Berlioux send request to Fredette for FS presentation at August SHG meeting.

**Action Item:** Plan August SHG field trip to view desired conditions.

### **10:15 Natural Resources Working Group (NRWG) Update – Berlioux/Sitko**

- Continuation of the NRWG/SHG discussion

This discussion began when Tom Osen, from the FS, approached the NRWG requesting that they work with the SHG so that the FS will only need to work with one collaborative group for the second EIS. It has resulted in back and forth communication between the two groups and it is intended to result in an agreement between the two groups that will outline the steps they can take to move forward together into the second EIS. Today the SHG will review the Joint Feedback letter that was distributed by Pascal Berlioux and Steve Gatewood. *The Joint Feedback letter is available for viewing on BASECAMP.*

**Disclaimer:** The letter only provides feedback, it is not a formal decision.

According to Berlioux, the Joint Feedback document was presented at the NRWG meeting on July 21st. NRWG members voted to sign the 4FRI charter as outlined in point 1 and while they, in concept, accepted points 2-8 one NRWG member felt that they needed more time to appropriately discuss the remaining items. Berlioux asked Tommie Martin if he accurately characterized the conversation. She responded by saying that the group voted in support of point #1 and #2-8 in concept but needed more time to discuss it.

Different opinions were voiced by stakeholders, ranging from those who were in favor of more open discussion pending clarification of terms found in the provided points, to Aumack who found the proposal being presented by the NRWG as being a legitimate request because it would build the capacity for leadership by east side members as the group enters the second EIS. There did seem to be consensus amongst group members concerning the use of the terms "east" and "west" side, boundaries either need to be associated to these areas or their use needs to be eliminated. For example, what are the guidelines for being an east side or west side co-Chair? Would the east side be able to address the issues that arise in the Tonto and Coconino National Forest acreage within the second EIS project area?

As the discussion on the feedback points progressed, many stakeholders began to question the need for an agreement. The SHG is already all inclusive so anyone can become involved by attending meetings or signing the charter and at each meeting there is a request for more co-Chair volunteers. Many members of the NRWG are already members of the SHG and if they would like to step into leadership roles they are free to do so, in fact, the perspective that they bring to table will be highly appreciated. As earlier discussed the FS will need feedback from the SHG at certain times, this discussion should not become a priority over the work that needs to be completed. Nonetheless, Aumack reiterated that the proposal presented by the NRWG is a legitimate request.

Many stakeholders have the same concerns as the industry members associated with the NRWG. They also see the second EIS as an opportunity to address the questions that are being presented by industry and if they are able to solve the problem associated with biomass everyone on the Mogollon Rim will benefit. It is recognized that some members of the SHG believe that the industry economic viability challenges pose the biggest threats to the 4FRI project. One goal of 4FRI is to create an economically viable offering and to use the economy to fund the restoration treatments. This can happen if the decisions that are made by the group are balanced; reflect the perspective of stakeholders across the total project area boundary; and take into consideration the economic constraints. Collaborative members may have special interests, but the objective is to find the common ground.

The overall discussion is best summarized by Greg Smith, "4FRI is the brand that everyone in this room rides for."

The group worked with Swaney to identify how the 8 points should be addressed. The discussion is summarized as follows:

1. Supervisor Whiting will sign the charter at the August SHG meeting. This was well received by the group and signing the charter would allow the NRWG to become an equal partner.
2. The Co-Chair structure will be discussed by the Steering Committee (the SC is going to initially act as the Charter Revision Workgroup).
3. Who chairs the 2nd EIS Planning Workgroup will be addressed by the 2nd EIS Planning Work Group. Berlioux will send an invitation to NRWG members to join the working group.
4. Will be reviewed by the 2nd EIS Planning work group and the Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation Workgroup (group development currently postponed until activated by Steve Gatewood).
5. The timetable of the 2nd EIS will be discussed at the August SHG meeting.
6. Will be assigned to The Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation workgroup (group development currently postponed until activated by Steve Gatewood).
7. No longer requires discussion.
8. The SHG agreed that the approved minutes from this meeting can act as the document outlining the agreement between the Forest Service, NRWG and the SHG.

With regard to point 8, Summerfelt asked if the minutes are sufficient communication to the FS of the NRWG and 4FRI decision, or if a formal letter required? John Buehler stated that if our group does not require a letter to remember what is decided then the FS does not need a letter. He also stated that a

letter is a great point of reference, it is a tool that can be used to go back to as a way to help remember what is officially decided. Berlioux said if a letter is not required it can be removed from the list, it was only added because it was deemed appropriate.

Mention was made of continuing the conversation between the SHG and NRWG. Martin stated that there may be need for more discussion but that this should not bog down the second EIS.

During the discussion the following members volunteered to participate in the EIS Planning Group: Pascal Berlioux, Rebecca Davidson, Ann De Marco, David Dorum, Tommie Martin, Joe Miller, Audrey Owens, Todd Schulke, Greg Smith, and Travis Woolley. Note: Rebecca may not be a member of this working group, but she stated someone from SRP would participate. This is the same for David Dorum and Audrey Owens from Arizona Game and Fish.

Berlioux agreed to convene the first meeting of the 2nd EIS working group. Miller suggested that the first meeting happen within two weeks of the SHG meeting. Berlioux agreed to convene the first meeting of the 2nd EIS working group as soon as possible.

**Action Item:** Email list of members of EIS Planning Group to Berlioux. He will send to email to NRWG.

**Action Item:** Berlioux will convene the 2nd EIS Working Group as soon as possible.

**Action Item:** Berlioux will send an email to NRWG members asking if they would like to join or remain on the BASECAMP distribution list (some regular NRWG attendees at SHG meetings are not on BASECAMP).

**10:45 Break**

**11:00 Working Group Updates**

- **Multi-party Monitoring Board (MPMB) – Esch**

The MPMB is working informally with Dan Kipervaser, the group's FS monitoring coordinator, to obtain clarification from the forest supervisors on the objection resolution letter. The Rocky Mountain Bird Observatory monitoring of songbirds and goshawks is completed and TNC will be hiring field crew members to conduct ground plot monitoring. The remote sensing work will be done later this summer.

- **Communications Working Group (CWG) – Davidson**

Rebecca Davidson and Sue Sitko distributed two handouts to stakeholders during today's meeting, a draft newsletter that highlights the future document's format and their WG charter. The CWG would like stakeholders to send them ideas for the future quarterly newsletters, this includes catchy headers and potential topics of discussion. Group members were impressed with the draft newsletter and showed support for the establishment of quarterly newsletters.

Vosick (Question): Will the WG develop a distribution list for interested outside parties? Building this list is their next step and stakeholders will be able to distribute the newsletter once it is posted on BASECAMP.

When discussing the use of BASECAMP, the CWG plans to upload the finalized newsletter on BASECAMP as opposed to using the site as a means to revise the draft. The group will present the draft newsletter to the SC for approval or hardcopies at SHG meetings for approval. To help the WG effectively deliver press releases or statements the Communication section of the 4FRI charter needs to be reviewed and updated because the current process does not allow for efficient development of a newsletter and distribution in a timely manner.

Concluding their update, Sue Sitko made a request for volunteers to participate in the WG. Pascal Berlioux, Brienne Pettit, and Tayloe Dubay (named by Diane Vosick) agreed to participate.

- **SHG Letter to State Forester** - Summerfelt

Summerfelt distributed a letter to the SHG for review, it is addressed to Jeff Whitney requesting formal representation for 4FRI at the Arizona State Forest Industry Roundtable. It was requested by the SC request. The roundtable has not yet been developed, but the SHG would like to volunteer Steve Gatewood and Neil Chapman as 4FRI representatives once it becomes active. It was suggested that an invitation be made to NRWG members to have an NRWG industry member also act as a 4FRI representative at these meetings. It is believed that the proposed Arizona Forest Industry Roundtable will already include industry members from the White Mountains.

Stakeholders voiced no objections, the letter was approved then signed by the co-Chairs. *The finalized document is available for view on BASECAMP.*

- **Working Group Charter Template** – Summerfelt

With the development of new working groups, the EIS Planning Group and the Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation WG, the SC developed a format that the new groups could use when establishing their charters. The format is left to the discretion of the working group, but they need to address the items that are required to be included in their charter.

The only requirement that has changed pertaining to the working group charter is that each work group chair or designated representative now needs to participate in SC calls, provide updates, and assist with populating the Dashboard. This will help inform the SHG of the work that is being completed by the WGs and expedite SHG agenda development and any decision making processes.

- **Charter Revision Working Group** – Summerfelt

A Charter Revision Working Group will not be established. Initially, the SC will review the charter, section by section, and present their recommendations at future SHG meetings. All stakeholders have the ability to provide feedback concerning charter revisions, please send comments to any of the active or inactive co-Chairs (Pascal Berlioux, Steve Gatewood, Paul Summerfelt, Diane Vosick, and Sue Sitko).

- **Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation Working Group (DUI)** – Summerfelt

The development of the DUI is still in discussion and for the time being there will not be a call for volunteers, but this is an opportunity to discuss the topics that would be addressed by the potential group. These topics include workforce training, tablet technology, statewide strategy issues, and the dashboard issue.

A call for WG members will be made at the August SHG meeting.

### **11:45 Advance Follow-up** – Gatewood

- SHG Meeting Schedule

The goal is to transition to quarterly SHG meetings, but for the time being there will be monthly meetings.

- Steering Committee Update

- a. Meeting Schedule – transitioning to monthly meetings
- b. Composition – Working group representative now need to participate in SC calls.

**NOTE: If there are any changes to the SC Distribution list an email requesting that the list be updated must be sent to [Tiffany.Woods@nau.edu](mailto:Tiffany.Woods@nau.edu), otherwise the list will remain as is.**

### **12:15 Review Action Items/Adjourn**

<b>Action Item</b>	<b>Lead</b>	<b>Status</b>
1. Determine date for Dr. Jack Williams Presentation on T&E Fish in the Southwest	Steering Committee/Miller	
2. Organize Tablet Technology Presentation and Clark TO field trip for future SHG meeting	SC TBD	
3. Re-post BASECAMP Opt-in Reminder and Deadline	Woods	Complete
4. Send request to NRWG distribution list to opt-in/join the 4FRI BASECAMP	Berlioux	
5. Provide Pascal list of EIS Planning group members so that he can outreach to NRWG members to also join, the request sent to NRWG will include an invitation to join all active working groups	Woods/Berlioux	
6. Establish a desired conditions field trip for August meeting – coinciding with FS presentation	SC	
7. Send email to Fredette requesting that the FS give a presentation at the August meeting	Berlioux	
8. Convene 2nd EIS planning Group	Berlioux	

**The 08/26/15 meeting information:**

Wednesday, August 26, 2015  
 Arizona Game and Fish – Region I Office  
 2878 East White Mountain Boulevard, Pinetop, AZ 85935  
 Teleconference line: (712) 775-7031, code: 439290611#

**Anticipated agenda items for future meetings:**

1. Forest Service Presentation and field trip to desired conditions (August)
2. Review draft newsletter produced by CWG (August)
3. Call for DUI WG members (August)
4. Mexican Gray Wolf Presentation (October)
5. Dr. Jack Williams Presentation on T&E Fish in the Southwest (October/November)