



4FRI Stakeholder Group Meeting

Wednesday, October 26th, 2016, 9AM-12:10PM
Coconino National Forest Supervisor's Office
1824 Thompson St, Flagstaff, AZ 86001

Teleconference line: (712) 775-7031, code: 439290611#

In Attendance: Paul Watson, Stephen Reidhead, Greg Smith, Ann Mottek Lucas, Hannah Griscom, Steven Flora, Travis Bruner, Heather Provencio, Keith Pajkos, Paul Summerfelt, Steve Gatewood, Jay Smith, Randy Fuller, Sue Sitko, Royce Kincanon, Tom Mackin, Neil Chapman, Henry Provencio, Diane Vosick, Bryce Esch, Tiffany Woods, Allison Jourden, Patrick Rappold, Dianne Berry, Matt Cole, Mary Lata, Mark Nigrelli, Sharon Boe, Scott Russell, Jill Grams, Michele Ralston, Joe Miller, Robert Sanchez, Patti Turpin, Travis Woolley, Dan Kipervaser, Pascal Berlioux, Aaron Green, Wade Ward, Nina Hubbard, Shaula Hedwall

Phone-In: Sharon Adams, Ann Anderson

9:05 Approve minutes from the August 24th SHG meeting — Paul Watson
Approved with no changes

9:10 Review action items from the August 24th SHG meeting — Paul Watson

Action Item	Lead	Status
1. Posting Topics Addressed in Scoping Comments on BASECAMP	USFS – Annette Fredette	Completed
2. Determine the value of depicting goals on the Dashboard	IWG – Steve Horner	No Update

9:15 Call to the Public - None

9:20 USFS Update – 4FRI Board, Coordinators
• **Update to GEP Contract Status** – Scott Russell

Personnel Additions: Matt Cole - Wildlife Biologist, Sharon Boe – Administrative Processor, Randy Fuller – A-S Staff Officer for Forestry and Fuels

They've taken the comments on the proposed action for the RIM Country EIS and turned them in to a set of issues and proposed alternatives that will be presented at the next 4FRI meeting (November), as a proposal.

Timber Sales/ Mechanical Thinning Offering – Working with IWG to make sure industry capacity is there for the purpose of implementation and not just offerings. Holding various meetings in the next few months to try and come up with a solid 3-year plan on how to ramp up the mechanical thinning work being done.

Planning Work Group is helping in developing a flexible approach to the management of how we might provide for a better understanding of what the conditions are in the Rim Country and

what needs to be done with them. The flexible approach prepares and allows for variances in what conditions actually are on these acres and what can be done with them.

Good Earth Power – Close to accepting an operating plan with them for their operations. Instead of focusing on multiple task orders, GEP has focused their energy and resources on one task order. They've been finishing up the Pomeroy task order and have moved to work on the McCracken task order. Discussions are still going on with Good Earth regarding investments in the mills and how that could contribute to ramping up capacity.

Working with TNC regarding a stewardship agreement proposal. They've got master stewardship agreements that they're looking to put into place with both eastern AZ counties as well as TNC. They're still moving to a shared position with the Wild Turkey Foundation (NWTF) to get them more involved with implementation and to move them towards forming a stewardship agreement.

Stewardship agreements offer another avenue for implementing restoration objectives. The agreement with TNC is that FS would provide a number of acres that TNC would perform the work on. Developing a stewardship agreement involves lots of discussions and coordination between the groups as finding an alignment of interests is necessary. These agreements are intended to span across the entire 4FRI area. They're broad while supplemental partnership agreements are more specific to smaller areas within 4FRI.

Operations/ Coordinating Update –

- FY16 estimated acres treated mechanically =17477
- Apache-Sitgreaves:
 - Show Low South - close-out phase
 - Crooks - close-out phase
 - Hulsey Bench – Anticipated bid-date in November
- Coconino:
 - Fort Valley-Chimney Springs – Anticipated bid-date in December
- Kaibab:
 - Pomeroy - close-out phase
 - Cougar Park – Sold/ Pending Award
- Tonto:
 - Laramie – Sold/Awarded

Dan Kipervaser is currently compiling all CFLR spreadsheets to generate the contribution report. Diane Vosick emphasizes the importance of reporting contributions on the CFLR spreadsheets to demonstrate partner leverage and commitment. Time spent at 4FRI meetings can be leveraged as a match, as well as pieces of equipment and other acquisitions purchased in the effort towards completing 4FRI projects. For questions on what can be leveraged as match, contact Dan Kipervaser.

9:30 FS Presentation: Smoke Ecology – Mary Lata – Fire Ecologist

Smoke ecology is a part of fire ecology that is sometimes forgotten and is something that is not always talked about from a positive viewpoint. The Clean Air Act considers smoke from prescribed fires to be human-caused pollution, which legally limits use of prescribed fire treatments. Historically, the ideas on smoke focus around a theme of fertility, encourages

health, and is used for fumigation and sterilization purposes. Some ecosystems are adapted to the presence of smoke. In 1977, John Keely, a fire ecologist with USGS out of California, published the first example of scientific research linking smoke and germination. Beyond the work done by John Keely, we are way behind in terms of smoke ecology.

Smoke ecology studies have been infrequent, so in the summer of 2014, Lata developed a pilot study of her own, in her backyard, of 8 native plant species and their relationships with smoke. Her data shows that most plant species are more strongly responsive to some form of smoke-introduction in their germination processes. Her subjects involved a control with no smoke introduction, tests where seeds received smoke, tests where seeds and their soils received smoke, and tests where just the soils received smoke. Results varied by plant.

Ecology of Plant-Derived Smoke (2014) by Kayri Havens, Lara Jefferson, and Marcello Pennacchio – looks at over 1300 plant species around the world whose seeds have been tested for the effects of smoke.

Seed Dormancy is nature's way of telling plants to not germinate until conditions are appropriate in their surrounding environment. Every seed has a different set of germination cues, that are dictated by specific orders, intensities, and frequencies of events. Different plant species respond differently to the use of smoke as a germination tool, some plants are inhibited by the introduction of smoke to their germination patterns. Species that store their seeds in the soil have been the most responsive to smoke germination cues. Changes in the smoke regime of an ecosystem is predicted to have an effect on animal populations as well. Ex. Interrupting pheromone production in insects (Bees), potential habitat alterations.

Smoke regime – (similar to fire regime) Based on the frequency, duration, and concentration of smoke from wildland-fire in an environment

Berlioux – Because smoke is comprised of tiny particulates, it acts as a finely-grained fertilizer. Curious to see what results occur when plants are treated with coal smoke opposed to a wood-based smoke. Berlioux asks if coal smoke contains several compounds that are beneficial to plants like wood smoke apparently does.

Miller – There several fields where you might find a lot of existing knowledge in this area: Medical Products & Drug Development (trace minerals), and Agri-Businesses - the companies that are doing GMO work to enhance crop-production. Miller reemphasizes micro-fertilization.

10:45 Comprehensive Implementation Working Group Charter Review – Travis Bruner

In drafting the charter, the group determined a name for themselves, which is the "Comprehensive Implementation Work Group" (CIWG). Initially, the CIWG focused on implementation of the first EIS in this charter.

CIWG goals:

1. Comprehensive Restoration Opportunities to identify, prioritize, and implement habitat and ecosystem restoration opportunities other than mechanical thinning and prescribed burning across the 4FRI landscape.

2. Treatment Prioritization to provide SHG and FS with recommendations regarding treatment prioritization and sequencing for the first 4FRI EIS.
 - a. Would address other restoration opportunities, as well as thinning and burning
3. Engage the public and other organizations in these efforts
4. Coordinate with other WGs when appropriate

Initial Co-chairs: Steve Rosenstock, Diane Vosick, and Travis Bruner
 Initial FS Liaison: Henry Provencio

Primary Functions: to work with the FS and other partners to identify these non-mechanical thinning and non-burning projects and to facilitate their compliance with the appropriate forms of guidance. The group will serve in reviewing and commenting on the RMRS model with the Industry WG, and provide a recommendation to the SHG and FS as to how they see it playing out, and whether or not they support it. This group works in coordination with the MPMB WG and others, transferring lessons learned during implementation to inform and improve the Rim Country EIS.

Charter Approval – Approved

11:05 Working Group Updates – All

- Planning WG (10 min) – Pascal Berlioux

PWG has been working to find the best practice to use GIS in order to identify the preponderance of large young trees. They've gone through a few iterations with different sets of criteria and they have come to some conclusions: the GIS will not allow us to identify the concept of 'young'. They will be able to identify 'large' trees, but the GIS will not tell them how old they are. The imputation on management will have to be drawn from biophysical characteristics of the trees, in order to make treatment decisions to emphasize future old growth recruitments, and quality canopy cover.

Group has decided to validate the last run of GIS by going on a field trip on November 17th. The SHG is invited and the CIWG is planning to attend. The group is going to try to maximize how many different sites they see (at least six; hopefully eight) and will have a lot less discussion. The objective will be to say that this is what the GIS indicates, and whether we want these types of sites included in treatment discussions.

- Industry WG (10 min) – Pascal Berlioux

The contract modification has been signed between the FS and GEP. There is a low probability that GEP will treat more than 50,000 acres, over the entire contract, and almost no probability that they will treat 50,000-100,000 acres. The consequence is that we immediately have nearly 450,000 acres waiting for treatment, in parallel to the GEP contract. IWG is beginning discussions with the FS on what is to be done with these remaining acres. This discussion involves what can be done to boost existing industry, how do we attract new industry, and how the FS can make sure their offers of acres are implementable in the short-term. IWG hopes to have a plan by Feb. 2017 on how to wrap-up implementation.

- Communications WG (10 min) – Sue Sitko

Sue distributed the October newsletter to Stakeholders: talks about how the SHG is comprised and what they do in terms of working groups and leadership. For the Nov. 16th meeting, the

SHG is advised to bring topics that they would like to see in the Jan. newsletter. Sue will not be attending, but Pascal will collect the ideas at the November meeting. Upon her return, Sue plans to start working on expanding the CWG by talking to individuals to gauge interest.

- MPMB WG (10 min) – Bryce Esch

The group is working on three things: one is implementation monitoring, not to be confused with the IWG, but they're developing some questions and metrics around the interpretation of the EIS to prescriptions, marking, and to operations on the ground. Working with FS to make sure that the Stakeholder-developed desired conditions are what we're seeing on the ground, and if that's not the case, to find the point at which things are not being translated properly. Working on establishing a learning-meeting in January for the MPMB, based around the RIM Country EIS area. They're anticipating the adoption of some further questions and metrics to the monitoring plan. Objective is to develop some priority topics to present to the SHG. Finally, they're working on developing the MPMB's focus for the next year.

- Comprehensive Implementation WG (10min) – Travis Bruner

Travis anticipates that there will be more to report about the T Six Spring restoration project at the November meeting. If anyone is interested in being on CIWG email list, email Travis at tbruner@grandcanyontrust.org.

11:55 Stakeholder Disclosures – All

Miller – The Gila Trout Chapter of Trout Unlimited is moving forward with their stream temperature monitoring project, they're working on draft contracts for sourcing equipment and funds, and will be cooperating with AZ Game and Fish, the Apache-Sitgreaves effort, the Tonto National Forest, the PWG, the CIWG, and the USFS with their Rocky Mountain Research facility in Boise. They want to be sure that the data they collect and the locations they select are beneficial to this effort. Trout Unlimited will be recruiting for a new staff position, a Conservation Professional, who will also be involved with 4FRI.

Trout Unlimited is organized to 37 councils throughout the country – the AZ council was given a Council Excellence Award, and Miller thanks the SHG for providing opportunities that allowed them to earn this award.

Summerfelt - A field trip was held with members from the Sierra Club to clarify and correct some misrepresentation issues and other issues with the FWPP. Another field trip was held with officials from the Navajo Nation regarding a parcel of property in the FWPP area. They're engaged with FWPP and 4FRI and they're aware of this effort and are supportive. Their absence shouldn't be counted as non-interest.

There was a field trip for county supervisors – 21 people attended and talked about forest issues. The Speaker of the House from the AZ Legislature was there, as well as individuals associated with the senate and the house.

On Nov. 8th at 1pm, there is a field trip to the observatory mesa parcel within FWPP.

12:00 Review Action Items

Action Item	Lead	Status
1. Provide issues identified for the Rim Country EIS at November Meeting	Scott Russell	
2. Send CFLR spreadsheets to Dan on leveraged contributions to 4FRI	Everyone	
3. Post PWG Field Trip information on BaseCamp	Pascal Berlioux	
4. Post Newsletter on BC and 4FRI.org	Sue Sitko and Allison Jourden	Complete
5. Bring topic ideas for January's newsletter to the November meeting	Everyone	