



4FRI Stakeholder Group Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, September 23, 2015, 9AM – 12:00PM

Coconino National Forest Supervisor's Office

1824 South Thompson Street, Flagstaff, AZ 86001

Teleconference line: (712) 775-7031, code: 439290611#

Attendance: Pascal Berlioux, Buck Swaney, Steve Gatewood, Paul Summerfelt, Chris Stephan, Tom Mackin, Billy Masters, Greg Smith, Steve Stratton, Tanya Owens, Dick Fleishman, Mark Nigrelli, Joe Miller, Sue Sitko, Randy Fuller, Steve Horner, Keith Pajkos, Debbie Cress, Brad Worsley, Bryce Esch, Diane Vosick, Tiffany Woods, Scott Russell, Laura Jo West, Wendy Jo Haskins, Tom Osen, Steve Reidhead, Jana Sterling, Jill Grams, Emery Cohen, Nancy Walls, Ed Koberstein, Andy Cuevas, Anne Mottek Lucas, Gary Snider, Aaron Green, Ethan Aumack, Ron Klawitter, Rebecca Davidson, Mandy Metzger, Alycin Gitlin

On the Phone: Jason Whiting, Paul Watson, Audrey Owens, Todd Schulke, Kelly Wolff-Krauter, Dave Dorum, Jerry Payne

9:05 Approve minutes from August 26th SHG meeting — Berlioux

Minutes Approved

9:10 Review action items from August 26th SHG meeting — Berlioux

Action Item	Lead	Status
1. Review the Bridge the Gap Strategic Plan	Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation WG	Complete
2. Provide feedback to the FS on Desired Conditions (Due by September)	EIS Planning Group / Steering Committee	In Progress
3. Provide feedback on the SHG Landscape Strategy and its status in the second EIS	EIS Planning Group / Steering Committee	In Progress – Future SHG Agenda Item
4. Provide feedback to the FS on the Preponderance of Large Young Trees (Due by November)	EIS Planning Group / Steering Committee	In Progress – Future SHG Agenda Item
5. Post Communications Working Group updated process for releasing newsletters on BASECAMP and update the charter to reflect the new process	Swaney	In Progress
6. Convene first Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation meeting	Gatewood Berlioux	In Progress – Scheduled for Friday, 9/25/15
7. Post workgroup charters on BASECAMP	Gatewood/ Berlioux	In Progress
8. Add good standing exemption process to charter	Swaney	In Progress
9. Determine date for Dr. Jack Williams Presentation on T&E Fish in the Southwest	Steering Committee/Miller	November SHG Agenda Item

10. Organize Tablet Technology Presentation and Clark TO field trip for future SHG meeting	SC TNC	TBD. Working on a date. 2016 meeting agenda.
--	--------	--

9:20 Call to the Public

No Comments

9:25 USFS Update – Fredette/Fleishman

The 4FRI Monthly Update is available for viewing on BASECAMP. Since it was posted September 14th there have been three changes. Isham was offered and sold to NewPac Fibre, Leo Grove was offered and sold to Tri Star Logging, and Munds Park was offered, but it received no bids. An additional 24,000 acres will be issued within the next week, the last week of the fiscal year (FY) and the FS expects to increase prescribed burning activities as we are now entering the prescribed burning season.

The update shows that the total number of acres treated under the 4FRI contract for the FY is 2,405 so far. Dick will provide a more accurate update that reflects the total number of acres treated under the contract for FY 2015 after September 30th.

Concerning the NEPA process for the second EIS, the FS is working to finalize the exterior boundary, they are working to pin down the pine type and exclude pinyon juniper (PJ). They currently have a tentative database because they have run through all three forests for current conditions, it includes all stands inside and some outside the analysis area. It took 6 months to determine the final boundary for the first EIS and while this process is taking some time for the second EIS they are nearly finished. Also, Paula Cote and Annette Fredette are working to release the draft forest plan amendments for the Tonto NF before the October SHG meeting presentation so that stakeholders have an opportunity to review the language.

Additional Updates – The FS and the Nature Conservancy (TNC) met to see the activity options that are available to obtain production data for the tablet technology prior to the Clark TO.

The resolution meeting with the two objectors was yesterday, September 22nd, for the Flagstaff Watershed Protection Project (FWPP). The issues were resolved and they expect to have a final decision by the end of next week.

9:35 Working Group Updates

- Multi-party Monitoring Board – Esch

The MPMB is wrapping up the field season and they plan to do an assessment/review of their monitoring activities over past year. Afterwards, they will begin to plan for next season's monitoring activities. They are also working on organizing an MSO workshop, which they project to take place later this year or early next year. Once they have a firm date they will release additional information. A request was made for the MPMB to give a presentation on their annual monitoring accomplishment and assessment at the January or February 2016 SHG meeting.

Action Item: Finalize date for MPMB presentation on FY15 monitoring assessment.

- Communications Working Group – Davidson/Sitko

After the August SHG meeting, the Communications Workgroup posted the revamped, stakeholder approved, newsletter on BASECAMP. In anticipation of the next 4FRI newsletter, that is expected to be released in January, Sue passed out 2 handouts that were to be voluntarily filled in by present stakeholders for:

1. future newsletter topics for the various categories found in the newsletter

2. the development of a distribution list for potentially interested parties outside of the stakeholder group

The workgroup also quickly reviewed the updated process for releasing the next 4FRI newsletter. After today's meeting, using the information provided in the newsletter topic handout, the workgroup will collect and generate story ideas. At the October meeting they will facilitate a group discussion to determine more specific stories. A mock up version of the newsletter will be reviewed at the November meeting and the final review and approval will occur at the January Steering Committee call. The final/approved newsletter will be distributed to stakeholders at the January SHG meeting.

Action Item: Post recent newsletter on public 4FRI site.

- Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation Working Group – Berlioux

Pascal Berlioux has stepped in for Steve Gatewood and has taken responsibility for convening the first DUI meeting, which is scheduled for September 25th at 10AM at the Navajo County Large Conference Room in Show Low, anyone interested is invited to attend. At this meeting the group will develop a charter, determine leadership, and decide on a consistent meeting schedule. Afterwards the primary objective of the group will be to produce a dashboard, which is a business concept that will help us gauge how we are doing as an initiative. It will measure the progress of our major activities, such as the second EIS planning, implementation of the first EIS, monitoring of the first EIS, etc. Once the dashboard is developed, it will be presented to the SHG for approval. Another component of the group will be to provide expertise and guidance concerning industry matters and implementation as many members of the group are from industry. Members would work to develop creative solutions to the challenges faced by industry.

Action Item: Post Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation meeting information on BASECAMP.

Ethan Aumack suggested that the DUI workgroup or the SC discuss a potential Good Earth Power AZ (GEP) presentation that would be focused on the company's 2016 work plan. Present SC members agreed a request should be made to GEP with hopes that they would be able to present on or before the January SHG meeting. The FS noted that the 4FRI contract year is based on the award date (which was in May), not the FY or the calendar year.

Action Item: Request GEP to give a presentation on their implementation plans for the 2016 calendar year, preferably in January. Greg Smith.

When discussing the development of the dashboard, it is important to recognize that acres treated isn't the only component of gauging the success of 4FRI, other considerations should include restoration of seeps and springs, quality acres that are treated, endangered species habitat, etc. While the workgroup is considering the implementation success of the first EIS, they are more concerned with helping to provide input on how to develop an implementation plan for the second EIS that makes sense to industry.

In previous SHG meetings there has been discussion of an Industry Roundtable that was to be convened by Arizona State Forestry. If this roundtable is created it might be a more sufficient resource for addressing industry needs. Jerry Payne, from Arizona State Forestry, notified that the establishment of the roundtable has been postponed as a result of the feedback he received when visiting sawmills. If they proceed with convening this group, the questions presented by industry are the ones that will need to take priority in being answered.

There was general consensus amongst present meeting attendees that the dashboard should notify stakeholders of what they are achieving against their overall goal. It should also be used as a means to find out why so few acres have been treated under the first EIS contract to see if the group could provide any feedback on what could be done to help improve the process.

- ~~EIS Planning Group~~ 4FRI Planning Workgroup– Berlioux
 - Working Group Charter

The 4FRI Planning Workgroup distributed the charter that they developed at their first meeting. The SHG approved by the charter, minus minor modifications suggested by the FS. The final/approved copy will be posted on BASECAMP before September 25th.

Action Item: Update Charter with FS Feedback from today's meeting then post workgroup charter on BASECAMP.

9:50 SHG Feedback on Desired Conditions – EIS Planning Group

At the August SHG meeting, the FS presented on the 4FRI desired forest conditions (DFCs), specifically they reviewed the DFCs that would differ in the second EIS from the first EIS as a result of the change in the landscape. The FS requested that the SHG provide feedback at today's meeting and the action item was assigned to the 4FRI Planning Group. As the Planning Group wasn't chartered until today, they were unable to develop a formal recommendation, but they still had feedback to present and requested further FS and SHG input on how to proceed as formal language for the DFC still hasn't been provided.

Since the SHG has not formally endorsed the first record of decision (ROD) yet, and the outcome of the objection resolution process, the SHG could endorse the second EIS DFCs that were discussed and approved in the first EIS as they would remain the same. For the DFCs that are specific to the second EIS, should the group wait until the end of the appeal process for the Apache Sitgreaves (A-S) revised forest plan to provide feedback as this would provide the group with formal language? The appeal process ends on December 24, 2015.

A discussion between stakeholders and FS members occurred concerning the above question. The SHG generally accepts the DFCs as developed in the first EIS. While no formal language was provided concerning the newly identified DFCs, the FS did state the need to move forward in incremental steps as much as possible. The SHG could use the following document *DFCs from ASNF Revised Forest Plan – Excerpt for Ponderosa Pine, Mixed Conifer, Wildlife and Rare Plants*, available on BASECAMP, as a working document that could help expedite the process.

The FS has developed a large document of all DFCs from the forest plans, this will be made available in coming months. The FS will also post the final forest plan amendment language when available.

Action Item: 4FRI Planning Group review the Draft A-S Revised Forest Plan Desired Conditions that was handed out at the August SHG meeting for any concerns.

Action Item: Post final forest plan amendment language for review by SHG.

10:45 Update on 5 year A-S Plan (Bridge Projects) – Berlioux

At the last Natural Resources Working Group (NRWG) meeting, FS members from the A-S distributed two documents. The first was a 5 Year Action Plan that provided information on timber volume/acres that are projected to become available by district then project in the next 5 years. This document allows industry to predict what will be available and shows how the FS and ECO has worked together to ensure continuity for industry between the first EIS and the second EIS. The second document provided information on the coming timber sales for the first 6 months of 2016, it includes when the timber sales will be available and TO characteristics.

As the projects evolved from the White Mountain Stewardship contract to the Bridge the Gap projects, it has also influenced the internal and external processes associated with timber offerings/sales. Internally

the FS is working to now ensure that offerings are more consistently offered thought out the years as opposed to being primarily released in one quarter and they have worked to release firmer projections. Externally they have worked to improve how industry is able to view upcoming sales and aided industry in better understanding how contracts work.

Ethan Aumack requested that information be provided on the projects listed in the A-S 5 Year Action Plan that gives insight on the broader ecological context for the projects and how they fit into the first EIS, the second EIS and the overall footprint. Scott Russell shared that the four forest are all working on a 5 year action plan and that the criteria outlining why and where they will do a project will be made available to the SHG at the same time it is available to the public. Pascal added that many of these projects are fully compliant with the 4FRI outlook, in fact, some of the TOs were pulled from the first EIS and to be made into timber sales outside of the 4FRI contract, but they are still 4FRI NEPA.

11:00 Stakeholder Disclosures and Announcements – All

Joe Miller (Trout Unlimited) – Joe was contacted by the facilitator of the FS National Advisory FACA committee and was interviewed on the 2012 Planning Rule. He noted that the committee seemed unaware that there would be revisions made to the Tonto forest plan to bring it into alignment with 4FRI2. The State Director, John Hamell, of the Theodor Roosevelt Conservation Partnership plans to attend the October SHG meeting and sign the 4FRI charter.

Steve Horner (Campbell Global) – Campbell Global has officially signed the 4FRI charter.

Greg Smith (City of Pinetop Lakeside) – Genevieve Master's, Billy Master's wife, has just accepted the position of Forest Supervisor for the Umatilla National Forest.

Steve Gatewood (Wildwood Consulting) – The City of Flagstaff and the Flagstaff Fire Department have been doing a lot of thinning by Observatory Mesa, it is an extraordinary demonstration of the kind of thinning we want to see with Flagstaff Watershed Protection Project (FWPP) and 4FRI. It could serve as an ideal location for a 4FRI fieldtrip. Diane Vosick added that the FWPP objection meeting that she attended the day before was very positive as the issues brought forward by the Center for Biological Diversity (CBD) were resolved and the CBD agreed to withdraw their objection.

Stephen Reidhead (Tri Star Logging, Inc.) – Since leaving Good Earth Power AZ, Tri Star Logging has treated 7,883 acres of timbered forest lands and 5,400 acres of pinyon juniper.

11:15 SHG Charter Revision Update – Swaney

The primary goal of the revision update is to increase usability. Buck plans to take content out of the Charter body and move it to appendices as a way to simplify the charter and decrease confusion. Buck does need the charters from the working groups so that they can be added to the charter as appendices and also the roles, responsibilities and function of the Steering Committee. The goal is to post a draft charter to BASECAMP by September 30, 2015.

Current charter revisions group members include Buck Swaney, Diane Vosick, Todd Schulke, Pascal Berlioux and Sue Sitko.

Action Item: Post draft SHG Charter to BASECAMP on September 30th.

Action Item: Review and potential approval of updated 4FRI Charter at October SHG meeting.

11:30 Stakeholder Discussion – Berlioux/Gatewood/Swaney

- Discussion on facilitation – Swaney

At this time, nothing has changed since the August meeting update. An RFP will go out this month and Buck continues to plan to pursue the contract under Logan Simpson. If for some reason the contract hasn't been finalized before the October meeting there is a potential that Buck would facilitate the October meeting depending on the remaining budget in the prior contract.

- Future Field Trip – All

At the last SC call there was a discussion on organizing a DFC field trip, but no one volunteered to lead. Stakeholders have voiced interest, but there is a need for leadership.

- November/December Meeting Schedule – Swaney

At the August SHG meeting it was agreed that the November and December SHG meetings would be combined. The decided date is November 18th and it will be held in Flagstaff at the Coconino National Forest Supervisor's Office.

- Self-Assessment - Swaney

The SHG had a discussion on the need for continuing with the self-assessment. For last year's assessment, participation was much lower than the recommended number of 30 participants. However, as the composition of the SHG as changed, the self-assessment should still be used to track the evolution of the group. It was decided that the self-assessment will be released in December and that the results would be reviewed at the February meeting to help the group determine areas in need of improvement. If participation is not high, then the group should touch back on the subject of the necessity of the self-assessment.

Action Item: Continue Field Trip discussion at following SC Call.

11:45 Review Action Items/Adjourn

Action Item	Lead	Status
1. Finalize date for MPMB presentation on FY15 monitoring assessment	MPMB	
2. Post recent newsletter on public 4FRI site	Woods	
3. Post Dashboard, Utilization and Implementation meeting information on BASECAMP	Berlioux	
4. Request GEP to give a presentation on their implementation plans for 2016	Smith	
5. Update 4FRI Planning Workgroup charter with FS Feedback from today's meeting then post on BASECAMP	Berlioux	
6. Review the Draft A-S Revised Forest Plan Desired Conditions that was handed out at the August SHG meeting for any concerns	4FRI Planning Workgroup	
7. Post final forest plan amendment language for review by SHG	FS	
8. Post draft SHG Charter to BASECAMP on September 30 th	Swaney	
9. Review and potential approval of updated 4FRI Charter at October SHG meeting	All	
10. Continue Field Trip discussion at following SC Call	SC	