



**4FRI Stakeholders Meeting Minutes**  
**Tuesday, May 21<sup>st</sup> (10AM to 5PM)**  
**and Wednesday, May 22<sup>nd</sup> (9AM to 3PM)**  
**Coconino NF Supervisor's Office**  
**National Park Service Conference Room**  
**1824 S. Thompson St., Flagstaff, AZ**

**Call-in Number: 877-686-0400 ~ Passcode: 774-7488-215**

**Action Items for next meeting**

1. AM -> finish plan - LAM
2. Monitoring field trip - Dick & Amy
3. Mixed-conifer - July field trip
4. Continue Eastside discussion about the next EIS
5. Steering: Tuesday June 4, 2013 2-3:30 p.m.
6. Invite Roberta - Henry SC to line out specific topics and questions
7. Invite Don Walter - co-chairs
8. Add Sue Sitko to SC & remove Ed Smith
9. Mel Hannah would like to present on the White Mountain Apache Tribe Biomass project

**Tuesday, May 21<sup>st</sup> Schedule**

**In attendance:**

Stasia Begley, Pascal Berlioux, Sue Sitko, Lorna Thurman, Jerry Payne, Steve Gatewood, Mark Sensibaugh, Hunter Moore, Henry Provencio, Sharon Galbreath, Alicyn Gitlin, Steve Rosenstock, Amy Waltz, Scott Harger, Diane Vosick, Buck Swaney, Paul Summerfelt, Ethan Aumack, Todd Schulke, Russ Winn, Keith Pajkos; no one on phone

**Call to the Public: No members of the public spoke**

**Forest Service updates:**

- Henry noted that they have received comments on the DEIS. In particular, the Sierra Club members have submitted form letters that will be counted as only one comment
- About \$3 million in payback for FY13 fire borrowing that was intended for operations and data prep may not be received.
- The USFS is ready to issue more task orders, but RO contracting needs to give the go-ahead to do additional acres
- Are additional acres going to be included in the next task order? Henry doesn't know what the status is, you will have to ask Roberta Buskirk from RO contracting.

- Earl will be back at the end of May; Scott is acting
- Action item: There is a request to have Roberta to attend next SHG meeting. This request will be considered. Henry will ask her to attend if appropriate.
- What happened to the Eastside Boundary decision? Data collection in the next analysis area will focus on Ponderosa Pine and mixed-conifer. Most of the NEPA on the Tonto is already completed. Although the Tonto is and will continue to be part of the Initiative, the focus will primarily be on implementation rather than planning. Smaller amounts of data are needed on South Coconino National Forest to fill in information gaps
- The Forest Supervisors have agreed to move forward with one analysis across the rest of the 4FRI area
- Existing industry on the Apache Sitgreaves National Forest is likely to demand 20k acres/year;
- FS capacity may be an issue given the increase in industry demand
- Originally the USFS thought it would only need \$14mil in total appropriated dollars to restore 50k acres/year. Now the USFS realizes it will need more like \$20mil (total), this translate to an increase of approximately \$6-\$9 million in annual appropriated dollars. This money is needed to expand internal capacity to the level that they can prepare, survey and administer a 50,000 acre per year restoration program. A program that large will require a shift from a planning organization to an implementation organization. In order to make that transition it will require additional position, vehicles, office space, etc; as well as a shift in how employees spend their working hours.
- When will the Coconino NF Plan Revision be published? A draft will be out soon (June?) – for comment; the final won't be out until FY2014.

#### **Stakeholder Disclosures:**

- NAU and the ERI received 2 FOIA requests under the state law regarding the KNAU decision to stop an investigative story concerning Pioneer and whether or not there was a relationship to a donation provided by the ERI to KNAU to support a new social media app to provide accurate information on fire and other emergencies in the community. It has been found that during an emergency, citizens often rely on inaccurate social media to make decisions. The Knight Foundation gave KNAU a grant to establish the E928 app. ERI gave \$10k for the safety app because this is consistent with the mission of ERI. It had no relationship to the KNAU decision to stop the story on Pioneer.
- Eli Bernstein will be starting at the ERI June 3<sup>rd</sup> as a senior coordinator. His job will be to assist the 4FRI.

#### **Preparation for DEIS Comment Review Activities, *Buck Swaney***

- Buck rapidly reviewed 4 DEIS issues for consideration today (2, 4, 5 & 6); and 2 tomorrow (1 & 3)
- We will only record reservations or disagreements (no acquiescence; will be emailed to Buck as necessary)
- There were 9 key issues over the last 2 years – today, we'll go over 6 with 100% consensus; non-consensus items will be talked about tomorrow; all groups will submit their own organizational comments

The remaining notes are represented as the final recommendation statements on the DEIS prepared for the Forest Service. (view final [here](#))

#### **Revise/Decide Issue 2, *Buck Swaney***

- Key Issue #2 – unanimous

#### **Revise/Decide Issues 4&5, *Buck Swaney***

- Key Issue #4 – one “agree with acquiescence” with no comment
- Key Issue #5 – unanimous

#### **Revise/Decide Issue 6, *Buck Swaney***

- Key Issue #6 – unanimous

## Wrap and Adjourn

## Wednesday, May 22<sup>nd</sup> Schedule

Welcome, Introductions– *Diane Vosick & Buck Swaney*

### In Attendance:

Stasia Begley, Pascal Berlioux, Sharon Galbreath, Steve Gatewood, Alicyn Gitlin, Sue Sitko, Jerry Payne, Mark Sensibaugh, Hunter Moore, Henry Provencio, Steve Rosenstock, Amy Waltz, Scott Harger, Diane Vosick, Buck Swaney, Paul Summerfelt, Dick Fleishman, Shaula Hedwall, Scott Hunt, Alan Kaufmann, Anne Mottek Lucas, Tom Mackin, Keith Pajkos, Todd Schulke, Russ Winn, Neil Chapman, Robert Taylor, Mike Williams, Margaret Van Gilder, Kathy Hemenway; no one on phone

### Call to the Public – none

**Forest Service Presentation of Objection Process**, Margaret Van Gilder, Regional Appeals Coordinator, USFS Southwestern Region

- Dec 2012 Section 428 directed the Secretary to establish a pre-decisional objection process for projects and activities implementing Forest Plans in lieu of the post decisional appeal process used by the agency since 1993.
- The public does not have a standing to participate in objection resolution meetings unless you've submitted objections; otherwise members of the public can listen but can't participate
- Deputy regional forester, forest supervisor or deputy FS as reviewing officers are expected to participate in meetings
- Legal notices are required for the comment period and objection period but no legal notice of the final decision is required even though USFS must still inform public of decision as per FS and CEQ regulations
- Decisions are final from Reviewing Officers, but if there are still objections, it will go straight to litigation; However, the administrative processes must be exhausted before litigation
- 4FRI is a non-HFRA project (see Margaret Van Gilder's presentation, "Predecisional Administrative Review Process: 36 CFR 218" on BASECAMP)
- For more information contact Margaret Van Gilder contact info: 505.842.3223 [mvangilder@fs.fed.us](mailto:mvangilder@fs.fed.us)

**Review of 5/21 Accomplishments and Decision Process Review**, *DEIS WG Appointee*

- Organization or individual comments may be submitted separately from the recommendations submitted by the 4FRI group
- 14 voters were present
- A no vote means you agree

**Revise/Decide Issue 1**, *Buck Swaney*

- 13 agree as discussed; 1 agrees with a specific reservation = 14 agree

The Eastern Arizona Counties Organization (ECO) agreed with written Reservation on this issue because ECO believes that developing only a 'framework for sequencing' of the treatments is unsatisfactory. A 'framework for sequencing' has no specific meaning and does not integrate in the NEPA Record of Decision a schedule of execution, a commitment to it, and, therefore, an accountability mechanism for it. The Eastern Arizona Counties Organization fully understands that such sequencing and timing, and the resulting implementation schedule, could be modified as a result of unforeseeable events such as natural ignition fires. This is precisely why the concept of adaptive management is nested with the 4FRI DEIS. The Eastern Arizona Counties Organization strongly disagrees with the argument made during the 4FRI stakeholders meeting that adaptive management precludes an execution plan including timing and sequencing of the treatments. The very concept of adaptive management implies an initial plan, which may be adapted as required, as events unfold. Because the timely implementation of the restoration treatments is critical to meeting the purpose and needs of the proposed action, the Eastern Arizona Counties

Organization is concerned that the spatial and temporal sequencing of the treatments has a significant effect on: i) whether the purpose and needs will be met; and, ii) the number, type, intensity, and individual and cumulated effects of the treatments required to meet the purpose and needs. Consequently, the absence in the 4FRI DEIS of spatial and temporal strategic timing and sequencing of the treatments, and the influence of spatial and temporal prioritization of the treatments on the number, type, intensity, and individual and cumulated effects of treatments, may present a process risk for the 4FRI EIS.

**Revise/Decide Issue 3, *Buck Swaney***

- 14 Agree (unanimous) as discussed for sub-concerns 1 – 4 and additional strengthening recommendations, recorded in final comments. Additional comment and language referring to stakeholder differences on LTRS incorporation also approved unanimously.

**Possible Future Agenda Items:**

1. Full Cost Accounting of the Schultz Fire-ERI and Franke College of Business
2. Organize field trips to learn about mixed conifer and fire effects
3. Arizona Forest Restoration Partners, Don Walters (June meeting)

**Next Meetings:**

6/26 – Flagstaff, Coconino National Forest Supervisor’s Office, 1824 S. Thompson St  
7/24 – Pinetop, AZ Game and Fish, 2878 E White Mountain Blvd  
8/28 – Winslow  
9/25 -- Flagstaff